

Unit 2: Challenge History

Lesson 1: The Flip Side Debate

Adapted from *Pinoy Teach*
(www.pinoyteach.com)

Background

For one to get an accurate account of an event or issue, one needs to understand that there are many sides to a story, that truth is relative and knowledge is constructed based on a person's positionality. Through debating for different perspectives on an issue, one will be able to appreciate different ideas or points of view, and recognize its effectiveness to problem solving.

Connections to NCSS Standards

Culture: The students explore and ask questions about the nature of culture and specific aspects of culture, such as language and beliefs, and the influence of those aspects on human behavior.

Time, Continuity, and Change: The students expand their understanding of the past and of historical concepts and inquiry. They begin to understand and appreciate differences in historical perspectives, recognizing that interpretations are influenced by individual experiences, societal values, and cultural traditions.

People, Places, and Environments: The students relate their personal experiences to happenings in other environmental contexts. They use data and apply skills in analyzing human behavior in relation to its physical and cultural environment.

Power, Authority, and Governance: The students apply their awareness of rights and responsibilities in more complex contexts with emphasis on new applications.

Production, Distribution, and Consumption: The students expand their knowledge of economic concepts and principles, and use economic reasoning processes in addressing issues related to the fundamental economic questions.

Science, Technology, and Society: The students explore the complex relationships among technology, human values, and behavior.

Civic Ideals and Practices: The students expand their ability to analyze and evaluate the relationships between ideals and practice.

Lesson Objectives

The students will be able to:

- understand how people interpret and make sense of historic events through their own perspective or own lens
- realize the importance of analyzing multiple sides to every story to make an informed judgment

Time: four 1-hour sessions

Materials

Teacher

- *Pinoy Teach* handouts:
 - "The Flip Side"
 - "Fact or Opinion" (pdf)
 - "Lapu Lapu's Decision" (pdf)
 - "Magellan's Mission" (pdf)
 - "Judge & Jury" worksheet (pdf)
 - "Lapu Lapu Vs. Magellan" chart (pdf)
 - "Magellan's Defeat"
 - "Line of Demarcation" map (pdf)
- coin to flip
- stopwatch
- gavel
- kush ball to control speaking (if necessary)

Student

- “Journey Through the World” Journal
- dictionary

Procedure

A. Opening: Perspective

1. Ask the students the following questions:
 - a. How does a person’s positionality or background (ethnicity, culture, socio-economic class, gender, religion, age etc.) affect how they view the world?
 - b. What is truth?
 - c. Who controls the writing of knowledge (i.e. who writes history)?
 - d. Can ideas be diverse?
 - e. What could this be called?
2. Introduce the concept of “Perspective” as “a specific point of view in understanding and/or judging things and/or events.”
3. Write the lesson title on the board: “The Flip Side Debate,” and have the students predict from the title what they think the lesson is about.
4. Have the students read “The Flip Side” handout. Address any student questions.
5. Next, have the students develop class definitions for the following terms:
 - a. Fact – the state of things as they are; reality; actuality
 - b. Flip side – the other side of the story
 - c. Interpretation – the act of showing one’s own understanding of the meaning of something
 - d. Colonialism – control by one power over a dependent area or people, especially to exploit economically
6. Ask the students to give examples of each term or a story where they had differing interpretations.

B. Debate Preparation

1. Rearrange room to have desks face one another. Set aside room for the jury to sit in the front.
2. Tell the students they will be doing a debate. Ask a student to define what they think a “debate” is (an intelligent argument over a stated issue).
3. Ask the students to determine what rules are needed to have a good debate. List rules on the board.
4. Provide additional debate rules if necessary.
5. Have the class divide themselves into three groups: Lapu Lapu’s side, Magellan’s side, and Jury.
6. Write on the board and state the debate question: Who was right? Was Spain right to take over the Philippines? Was the Philippines right to reject Spanish invasion?
7. Have the groups read the following handouts, reminding them to look up words they don’t understand in their dictionary:
 - a. “Lapu Lapu’s Decision”
 - b. “Magellan’s Mission”
8. After the groups have read their handouts, give each group member a “Lapu Lapu Vs. Magellan” worksheet. Have the groups designate a team leader to read the questions out loud, and all team members should write their responses onto their own worksheets.

C. *Debate Preparation: Lapu Lapu’s Side

1. Inform the members of this group that Lapu Lapu was a chieftain and deserved the respect of royalty that befits a king or queen.

2. Help establish context for Lapu Lapu's world:
 - a. What was going on in Lapu Lapu's world before the Spanish came?
 - Can a place be discovered if people already existed? Was the Philippines discovered? Were people already living in the Philippines? Refer to diversity and civilization chapter.
 - Were the native Filipinos savages? Refer to civilization chapter.
 - Was there trade? Trade was already strong with the Arabs and Chinese. Maynila was a prosperous trading post lead by Chieftain Soliman.
 - Did social and political structure exist? The natives had village kingdoms ruled by separate leaders, similar to the Native American tribes.
 - Was there a religion? Islam and indigenous exists existed.
 - b. What did Spain want when they went to the Philippines?
 - It was Spain's intent to conquer and colonize the Philippines.
 - Spain wanted to convert the natives into Christianity.
 - How was Spain's interest to trade different from the Arabs and Chinese? Spain wanted to take advantage of the native's resources, unlike the Arabs or Chinese who integrated into Philippine society via reasons of trade.
 - c. Why did the Filipinos resist?
 - How would you feel if a rival school took over your school? How would you feel? What would you do?
- The Filipinos resisted Spanish rule and Christianization.
 - Not all Filipinos accepted vassalage/allegiance to Chieftain Humabon.
 - The Spanish were invading the Philippine land. Possession is 9/10th of the law as opposed to moral justification.
3. Each student needs to write down one key argument they will say during the debate and decide the order of presentation during the opening statement.

C. *Debate Preparation: Magellan's Side

1. Inform the members of this group that they are to play the role of "Conquistador," and that they believe in the "survival of the fittest" and "might makes right." They are superior and have the right to take over places and people.
2. Help establish context for Magellan's world:
 - a. What was going on in Spain's world at the time of 1491-1550?
 - Europe was undergoing the Age of Exploration.
 - The pope drew the "Line of Demarcation" to determine Spain and Portugal's right to the world. This imaginary line was drawn from North and South poles running alongside the coast of present day Senegal, Africa. East of the line was for Portugal and West was for Spain.
 - Magellan discovered the Philippines like Columbus discovered America.

- Spain had a definite social structure in place.
- b. What did Spain want?
 - Spain wanted to peacefully establish trade routes to the Orient for spices.
 - They wanted to help Filipinos see light and truth with Christianity. They did not want natives to be soulless heathens. They wanted to save them.
 - Spain wanted to civilize the Philippines. They wanted to help instill a sense of unity and nationalism amongst their fragmented and divided island country.
- c. Why did the Filipinos resist?
 - The Filipinos resisted because they did not want to be better than the other. Petty squabbling existed between clans.
 - Filipinos were ignorant pagans and did not know any better.
 - Filipinos could not accept Spanish superiority even though the Spanish were better.
- 3. Each student needs to write down one key argument they will say during the debate. Decide the order of presentation during the opening statement.

C. *Debate Preparation: Judge and Jury

1. Ask the members of this group what courtroom drama they saw on T.V. What was the role of the judge? What was the role of the jury?
2. Define the roles of the "Judge and Jury."
 - a. A judge is a public official with the authority to decide questions before the court. He/she is in charge of the courtroom and must keep it in order. If it gets too noisy or people are

talking out of turn, the judge uses the gavel to bring order, "Order in the court."

- b. A jury is composed of everyday, ordinary citizens representing the diverse segments of the world who listens to the evidence in a trial and determine what the facts are.
3. Hand out the sheet of "Fact or Opinion?" statements and have the jury determine fact or opinion statements.
4. Based on the results, determine who will be the judge, as well as, select a jury member to read the opening statements.

D. Court Simulated Debate: Lapu Lapu Vs. Magellan

1. Have the judge or elected jury member read the following before the trial/debate: "Ladies and gentlemen of the jury, welcome. This case is about deciding on the important question: Who was right? Was Spain right to take over the Philippines? Was the Philippines right to reject Spanish invasion? On one side, we have Lapu Lapu and on the other side we have Magellan. It is up to you, the jury, to interpret the truth based on the evidence produced in this courtroom case. We will begin with an opening statement on both sides, followed by a break to prepare for rebuttal on both sides, and closing arguments on both sides. We don't want one person to dominate the debate. We are looking for a diversity of voices. Jury members don't make up your mind until you hear all the evidence. Write the evidence on your worksheet. Be fair."
2. Flip a coin to decide who will go first.

Format of Debate

- Team 1: Opening Statement (2 minutes)

- Team 2: Opening Statement (2 minutes)
 - ---Break for Preparation of Rebuttal---
 - (1 minute)
 - Team 1: Rebuttal (1 minute)
 - Team 2: Rebuttal (1 minute)
 - ---Break for preparation of Closing---
 - (1 minute)
 - Team 1: Closing Statement (1 minute)
 - Team 2: Closing Statement (1 minute)
 - Total Time: 10 minutes
3. Jury deliberates individually. Each member of the jury individually stands up and gives their vote and reason. "I vote for _____ because _____." Tally votes and determine winner.
 4. Jury should give diverse votes. Point out that everyone saw the same debate but interpreted it differently. They had a different perspective on who won.

E. Closing:

1. Tell students it is not important who wins or loses but that they have gained a holistic picture of what happened.
2. Examine what actually resulted between Lapu Lapu and Magellan. Look over "Magellan's Defeat" handout. Lapu Lapu resisted domination. A fight ensued and Lapu Lapu's men killed Magellan. Forty years later another Spanish explorer, Miguel Legazpi set foot on Philippine soil and thus began the formal colonization of the islands.

Suggested Assessment

1. Break students into groups of 3 with one person representing Lapu Lapu, Magellan, and a jury member. Have students come to a consensus and write a balanced version of the historical encounter between Lapu Lapu and Magellan.

2. Have students respond to today's lessons in their "Journey Through the World" Journal.

Enrich/Extend

1. Be a textbook detective. Examine the passages written in your history book. Rewrite the passage so that it includes its counter perspectives.
2. Create a cartoon strip of Lapu Lapu and Magellan's encounter and battle.
3. Compare and contrast the "re-discovery" of the Philippines with the Taino encounter with Columbus or Native Hawaiians with Cooke.
4. Go outside and have students stand at various points on the school ground and describe how one specific object looks like from that viewpoint. Return to class and describe what you saw.

Resources

Print

1. *Pinoy Teach* workbook